

Sites of *Caṅkrama* (*Jingxing* 經行) in Faxian's Record*

KIM MINKU 金玟求

The Chinese University of Hong Kong
minku@cuhk.edu.hk

Keywords: Faxian, *caṅkrama*, *caṅkramaṇa*, Madhyadeśa, *caitya*,
經行, 經行處

DOI: <https://dx.doi.org/10.15239/hijbs.02.01.06>

Abstract: *Caṅkrama* is a classical Indian notion denoting a special form of ritualized locomotion or 'mindful pacing'. In Chinese Buddhism, *jingxing* is adopted, as early as in the Eastern Han translations by Lokakṣema, to render the technical sense of the Indic term, overriding pre-existing, homophonous parlance in Chinese. It is in this standard Buddhist context, too, that Faxian, who traveled India in the early fifth century, recorded ten specific sites of *jingxing* within India proper (or Madhyadeśa), associated with the Historical Buddha or other worthies in the past. The Chinese pilgrim monk's witness offers us an intriguing firsthand testimony to the sites of *caṅkrama* being actively commemorated and worshipped in Indian Buddhism as a sacred place.

* This essay stands as a preamble to a larger thread of discussion presented at the Faxian conference held in Xiangyuan 襄垣, Changzhi 長治 (Shanxi) in March 2017. The main art-historical part of the conference paper has been published as a separate essay, 'Where the Blessed One Paced Mindfully'. The author

I. Introduction

The early Liu Song 劉宋 (420–479) record (*T* no. 2085) of Faxian's 法顯 (trad. 337–ca. 422) pilgrimage (ca. 399–412) to India and the adjacent world intrigues us with a wide array of Buddhist, geographical, historical, linguistic, and other Sino-Indian topics and problems on which it touches.¹ Among these, this paper picks up specifically on the term *jingxing* 經行 in the pilgrim's record. With the philological particulars of the term to be investigated in what follows, for now it suffices to say that the Middle Chinese expression (EMC *kejŋ ɣajŋ*) has a Buddhist-technical counterpart in the Indic *caṅkrama*, which signifies a type of ritualized ambulation or 'mindful pacing', the specific translation I adopt in this paper.²

is most thankful to Chen Jinhua 陳金華 for his invitation to the conference and for having this current paper translated into Chinese. In assisting him for the organization of the conference, the author aspired to invite Yi Chaech'ang 李載昌 (1928–2017), the first translator of Faxian's text into Korean. His original translation had been published serially in a now exceedingly obscure periodical throughout the 1970s; later, it was revised into a *bunkobon*-size paperback, *Pöp'yön jön* 法顯傳. The latter edition was then entered, with minimal alterations, into the massive *Han'gŭl taejanggyōng* 한글大藏經 series (vol. 248). See Yi, *Kosŭng Pöp'yön jön* 高僧法顯傳. When I was seeking him in late 2016 for the conference, Professor Yi was already too feeble to undertake international travel, and we belatedly heard that he passed away in December 2017, only several months after the conference. Nevertheless, I was privileged to invite Lim Sanghee [Im Sanghŭi] 林祥姬, who has recently completed a new version of the translation in Korean. See Lim, *Kosŭng Pöp'yön jön*.

¹ Our *textus receptus* of *T* no. 2085, despite its relatively short length, is notoriously laden with a number of critical difficulties, beginning with the very ambiguity in the taxonomy among various titles under which the textual tradition (or traditions) has taken shape. The date of Faxian's departure may not necessarily be a clear-cut 'fact' either. According to the regnal year given in our *editio princeps* (51: 1.857a6), the date corresponds to 400 CE, but like the majority of scholars in the field, I, too, opt for 399, the year that the sexagenary of *jihai* 己亥 falls. Cf. Adachi, *Hokken den*, i–xxxii and 1, n. 2.

On his journey in India, Faxian witnessed several *jingxing* sites or *jingxingchu* 處 (viz. *caṅkramaṇa*), at which the Historical Buddha—and also some other Buddhist worthies of the mythic past—are known to have once walked in this manner. However elusive the nature of this walking activity was, scholars today must wonder how this historic knowledge reached the Chinese pilgrim. Particularly, art historians may be haunted by the suggested physicality of those sites described in Faxian's records. One of the sites in question is the Mahābodhi Temple complex (or *mahāvihāra*) in BodhGayā (Bihar), within which a reputed 'Caṅkramaṇa', despite various changes and alterations, has been preserved until today.

Before plunging into these thorny issues, we must survey several relevant related concepts in philology. This essay thus examines the Sinitic term *jingxing*, first by investigating its usages found in the classical (or pre-Buddhist) Chinese corpus and comparing these usages with those contemporary to Faxian. Then, I will consider Faxian's terminology *vis-à-vis* the Indic vocabularies of *caṅkrama* and *caṅkramaṇa* in a comparative linguistic perspective. While doing this, I will also review how the term has been translated into European languages since the nineteenth century. Finally, the paper will conclude by offering some suggestions on Faxian's underlying habit in recording the sites of *caṅkrama* in India.

II. *Jingxing* and *Caṅkrama*

In regards to morphology, the term *jingxing* 經行 can be understood as a disyllabic verbal compound. Here, the preceding *jing* 經, etymologically 'to pass through', is agglutinated to another verbal component, *xing* 行, 'to go', or, more performatively, 'to walk'.³ However, the precise lexical interrelation between the two morphemes is not automatically determined, as each can be considered, to some extent, as appositional to one another; both lemmas pertain to certain aspects

² For EMC (Early Middle Chinese), see Pulleyblank, *Lexicon*, 159 and 344.

³ Schuessler, *ABC Etymological Dictionary*, 317; Wang Li, 924, q.v.

of going or walking. But, in this shared spectrum of meanings, more weight would be placed on the latter, while more semantic complexity would be carried by the former. *Jīng* thus is subordinate, which modifies and complements the overall nuances of the primal *xíng*.

This observation is well supported by an actual textual occurrence, in which the compound is stacked as part of a serial verb construction, such as ‘*zhu jingxing zuo*’ 住經行坐. This example can be found in Faxian’s own record.⁴ Here, the meaning of *jingxing* rests between the interval of the acts of ‘standing’ (*zhu* 住), at one end of the spectrum, and ‘sitting’ (*zuo* 坐), at the other. With the addition of a fourth action, ‘lying-down’ (*wo* 臥), and by singling out the co-verb to *xíng*, the expression may be indeed expecting the more common, standard Buddhist formulation *xíng zhu zuo wo* 行住坐臥 (or *xíng li zuo wo* with *zhu* replaced by *li* 立). Collectively termed as the ‘Four Postures’ (*sishi* 四勢) or ‘Departments’ (*weiyi* 威儀, *iryāpatha*), the figure of speech can be understood to encompass the entirety of one’s life. But any difficulty in Faxian’s expression of ‘*jingxing*’ still lies with the specific nuance of meaning denoted by *jīng*, as well as the differentiation it denotes between *jingxing* and the basic act of ‘walking’ as in ‘*xíng zhu zuo wo*’.

To be able to discern this nuance, it is necessary to examine the usage of ‘*jingxing*’ found elsewhere, ideally in a text whose existence predates Faxian’s departure from Chang’an 長安 (present-day Xi’an 西安) towards the end of the fourth century. Here, it is noteworthy that the *Han shu* 漢書, completed a few of centuries earlier than Faxian’s work, mentions three separate instances of *jingxing* in its Biographies (*zhuan* 傳) section. All three cases speak to the moral disposition of the individuals under discussion in relation to their ideological qualification to occupy an official post.⁵ With this Imperial Han 漢 (206 BCE–220 CE) morality strictly conforming to Confucian mainstream, *jīng* is here short for *jingshu* 經術, or ‘classical technique’

⁴ *T* no. 2085, 51: 1.864a24–25.

⁵ The individuals in question are Xue Guangde 薛廣德 (fl. mid-first century BCE), Kong Guang 孔光 (65 BCE–5 CE), and Shi Dan 師丹 (d. 3 CE). *Han shu*, *liezhuan* 列傳, *juan* 71, 3047; *juan* 81; 3354; and *juan* 86, 3507.

(or 'canonical art'), and the nominal stem, combined with *xing*, as in *pinxing* 品行, or 'moral behavior', forms a *dvandva*-type copulative compound to mean 'orthodox conduct' or even 'pedantic life'.⁶ Aside from these mentions, the received literary corpus of the Early Imperial period barely records actual usage of the word. With the aid of modern lexicons and full-text databases (including such digital tools as the Chinese Text Project), I am able to locate no more than six additional appearances of the term in the *Hou Han shu* 後漢書.⁷ This text, completed as late as the mid-fifth century, is at risk of having served as a conduit for later post-Han topoi to intrude into an earlier stratum of the matters under description here. However, mentions of *jingxing* appear to be immune to such anachronism. They all carry the same Confucian shade of meaning. In any case, Faxian's '*jingxing*' is thoroughly dissimilar to any of these non- or pre-Buddhist allusions.

What, then, does Faxian's expression mean exactly in a Buddhist context? In fact, the expression can be frequently observed in early Chinese Buddhist literature. Most prominently, it is none less than the tremendously important Eastern Han translator Zhi Loujiachen (or °chan) 支婁迦讖, or Lokakṣema (or °kṣama), who makes recurrent use of the term in his body of work.⁸ To be precise, four texts, which are generally assumed to have been produced by the Rouzhi (or Yue-°) 月支 translator (or which are, at least, considerably similar to his trans-

⁶ Cf. Luo ed., *Hanyu da cidian*, 9:861, q.v.

⁷ These are also in the Biographies. See *Houhan shu, liezhuan, juan 26*, 905, 916, 921; *juan 32*, 1131; *juan 37*, 1256; and *juan 69*, 2239 for Song Han 宋漢 (fl. early second century), Mou Rong 牟融 (d. 79), Wei Zhe 韋著 (fl. late second century), Yang Xing 陽興 (9–47), Huan Yu 桓郁 (d. 93), and Dou Wu 竇武 (d. 168), respectively.

⁸ Instead of citing Lokakṣema, Li Weiqi 李維琦 (*Fojing ciyu buisbi*, 174–175) lists the *Anban shouyi jing* 安般守意經 (*T* no. 602) as an Eastern-Han locus of the term. Of course, *T* no. 602 has been traditionally assigned to be a translation of An Shigao 安世高. But with the recent discovery of Kongōji 金剛寺 in Ōsaka of a Kamakura-period manuscript, titled *Da anban shouyi jing* 大安般守意經 (0926-002), such attribution now seems no more tenable. Cf. Zacchetti, 'A "New" Early Chinese Buddhist Commentary'; Nattier, *A Guide*,

lation style), show persistent and coherent usage of *jingxing*.⁹ Gratifyingly, this headword was given a due entry in Karashima Seishi's 辛島静志 (1957–2019) *tour-de-force* lexicography over the *Daoxing banruo* (or *bore*) *jing* 道行般若經 (T no. 224), as *jingxing* occurs once in Chapter 3 (Gongde pin 功德品) and again in Chapter 29 (Tanwujie pusa pin 曇無竭菩薩品).¹⁰ While defining *jingxing* as 'walk[ing] about (to take a break after meditation, eating, etc., to clear up drowsiness)', Karashima reports that neither of two occurrences in Lokakṣema's text has an exact equivalent wording in three parallel Sanskrit editions of the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* available today.¹¹ Nevertheless, he indicates that in Sanskrit parallels, *īryāpatha* obliquely replaces this gap found in the Bodhisattva Dharmodgata's Chapter. Karashima further consults a preceding Sanskrit passage, which is not parallel in Lokakṣema's Chinese text, but which includes another relevant keyword of interest for the present discussion, namely *caṅkrama*.¹²

The Indic term *caṅkrama* is an intensive (or frequentative), signifying the intensity (or frequency) of the action or state denoted by the root verb *kram* ('to walk').¹³ Assuming the meaning of 'walking (repeatedly) back and forth', the word may well convey the ritualized sense of 'walking about' or mindful locomotion. On the other hand,

60–61. *Jingxing* is left unrecognized as a lexicon of An Shigao's by Vetter, *A Lexicographical Study*, 235–236 and 274–276, qq.v.

⁹ These texts are the *Daoxing banruo jing* (T no. 224), the *Achu foguo jing* (T no. 313), the *Banzhou sanmei jing* (T no. 418), and the *Wenshushili wen pusa shu jing* 文殊師利問菩薩署經 (T no. 458, 14: 1.441a9). Nattier (*A Guide*, 76–77) lists eight core texts in total as works genuinely attributable to Lokakṣema.

¹⁰ T no. 224, 8: 2.433c14 and 10.474b16. Cf. Karashima, *A Critical Edition*, 80 and 508.

¹¹ Karashima, *A Glossary of Lokakṣema's Translation*, 272. Cf. Soothill and Hodous, *A Dictionary*, 409, q.v.: 'To walk about when meditating to prevent sleepiness; also as exercise to keep in health.'

¹² In fact, the spelling adopted by Karashima has an *anusvāra* (*caṅkrama*). But for the sake of consistency this paper emends the latter as *anunāsika*.

¹³ I owe this grammatical clarification of Sanskrit to Max Deeg. Also see Monier-Williams, *A Sanskrit-English Dictionary*, 382.

īryāpatha—composed of two nominal stems, *īryā*, derived from the verbal root, *īr* ('to go'), connoting 'wandering about as a religious ascetic, whether Jain or Buddhist, without hurting any creature', and *patha* or 'way'—may literally refer to the specific way of such mindful perambulation, or, more rhetorically, to the collection of the aforementioned Four Departments and its observations.¹⁴ That is to say, *caṅkrama* is, by metonymy, part of *īryāpatha*. It is thus becoming increasingly certain that Lokakṣema's *jingxing* does precisely convey this meaning of 'mindful walking'.

Besides, we learn that the prefix of *jīng* 經 before *xíng* 行 parallels the Indic original in an ambivalent but sophisticated way. It appears that the technical structure of Sanskrit intensive is here being duplicated by the shrewd positioning of *jīng* before *xíng*.¹⁵ More phenomenally, the Buddhist translative term *jingxing* displays an exquisite etymological resonance with the same word's pre-Buddhist usage in early China. As much as it could mean 'orthodox conduct', so, too, can the meaning of *īryāpatha* be articulated as always indicating 'orthodox conduct'.

The term *jingxing*, as it was meant by Lokakṣema, was used consistently throughout our known Buddhist corpus of the Three Kingdoms period (220–280).¹⁶ For instance, the word is found not only in Zhi Qian's 支謙 *Fanmoyu jing* 梵摩渝經 (*T* no. 76) and *Yizu jing* 義足經 (*T* no. 198), but also in Kang Senghui's 康僧會 *Liudu ji jing* 六度集經 (*T* no. 152).¹⁷ Additionally, the same use is noted in Zhu Fahu 竺法護, or Dharmarakṣa, mostly imposingly in his *Zheng Fabua jing* 正法華經 (*T* no. 263) and *Puyao jing* 普曜經 (*T* no. 186).¹⁸ In his

¹⁴ Monier-Williams, *A Sanskrit-English Dictionary*, 170.

¹⁵ Refreshingly, Zhu Qingzhi 朱慶之 (*Fodian*, 239–40) argues that *jīng* 經 here is a 'phonetic transcription' (*yinyi* 音譯) of *caṃ*. But in view of LHan (*key*), I see neither the initial consonant nor the medial vowel as permitting such interpretation. For LHan (Later Han Chinese), see Schuessler, *Minimal Old Chinese and Later Han Chinese*, 135, q.v.

¹⁶ For the works of the reliable Three Kingdoms date, see Nattier, *A Guide*, 111–60, 177–78.

¹⁷ *T* no. 76, 1: 1.884b12 and c6; *T* no. 198, 4: 1.176a3; *T* no. 152, 3: 6.34b25,

commendable lexicography of the former text, Karashima also lists Dharmarakṣa's wording of *jingxing*, whose parallelism of *caṅkrama* is reported to be abundantly found in Sanskrit editions of the *Lotus Sūtra*.¹⁹ All this suggests that the Chinese term, adopted as early as in Eastern Han translations, was widely in circulation, with its usage generally witnessed around the core readership of Buddhist texts through the Western Jin 晉 period (265–316).

Faxian's contemporary, Kumārajīva (Jiumoluoshi 鳩摩羅什, 344–413) also adopts *jingxing* in his translation of the *Lotus Sūtra* or *Miaofa lianhua jing* 妙法蓮華經 (*T* no. 262), which was, arguably, the most popular text in East Asian Buddhism.²⁰ Thus, it is no coincidence that in Japan, the word, pronounced *kyōgyō* 經行 (or *kinhin* via *Tō-on* 唐音, the *yomi* that is more common among the sectarian Zen communities, especially Sōtōshū 曹洞宗) is frequently listed in many bestselling dictionaries (*jiten* 辭典 or *jisho* 書).²¹ Today in Japan, the performance of mindful locomotion may take a regular part in a Buddhist practitioner's daily routine. Also known as *gyōzen* 行禪 or 'walking meditation', *kyōgyō* often denotes a break amid a longer session of *zazen* 座禪 (or 坐-) or 'seated meditation'. It is thus very rewarding to come across a pictorial manual of calisthenics that instructs on how to conduct this practice in the most decorous manner.²²

35a3, and 7.42c26. Zhu Qingzhi (*Fodian*, 239) discusses the reference of the *Fanmou jing*. On the other hand, Chen Xiulan 陳秀蘭 (*Dunhuang suwenxue*, 63–64) cites several Dunhuang-discovered *bianwen* 變文-type texts in reference to *jingxing*, but these manuscripts are dated much later (e.g. 933 CE), to the period under discussion here.

¹⁸ *T* no. 263, 9: 1.65a2; *T* no. 186, 3: 1.486:b27.

¹⁹ Karashima, *A Glossary of Dharmarakṣa's Translation*, 229–30.

²⁰ Karashima, 142–43.

²¹ For example, Shinmura Izuru 新村出, ed., *Kōjien* 広辞苑, 544, especially *kyōgyō*, and 553, s.v. *kyōdō* 經道; Matsumura Akira 松村明, ed., *Daijirin* 大辞林, 630 and 673.

²² See Sasagawa, 'Kinhin ni tsuite'; Kim, 'Where the Blessed One Paced Mindfully', fig. 1. I also thank Sobhitha Thero for personally demonstrating to me his act of *caṅkrama*, as now in practice within the Sinhalese *saṅghā*.

III. Faxian's Witness

Faxian's expression *jingxing*—and, more pertinently, *jingxingchu*, in the discussion that is to follow—is not at all removed from the general terminology noted above. This concordance, as personified by Faxian, will be seen to speak in favor of the assumption that the term (*jingxing* or *jingxingchu*) was in wide, regular, and established use among Buddhist *belles-lettres* by the early fifth century in China. In order to introduce the next step in my discussion of this issue, let me enumerate Faxian's actual quotes, according to the order of their appearance in *T* no. 2085:²³

Sāṅkāśya (Sengjiashi 僧迦施)

1. There is a site (along with other miscellaneous places of interest in the environs), where Śākyamuni and Three Buddhas of the Past *paced mindfully*, the location of which is commemorated by a *caitya* (塔).

過去三佛并釋迦文佛坐處經行處。及作諸佛形像處。盡有塔。今悉在。(51:1.860a2-4)

*Hari (Heli 呵梨)

2. There is a site, where the Buddha *paced mindfully*, the location of which is commemorated by a *caitya*.

佛於此中說法經行坐處盡起塔。(860b3-4)

Sāketa (Shaqi 沙祇)

3. There is a site, where the Four Buddhas (of the Past) *paced mindfully*, the location of which is commemorated by a *caitya*.

四佛經行坐處。起塔故在。(860b8)

²³ For a quick synoptic table, see Kim, 'Where the Blessed One Paced Mindfully', 182.

Śrāvastī (Shewei 舍衛)

4. Within Jetavana (Qihuan 祇洹) there is a site, where the Buddha used to *pace mindfully*, the location of which is commemorated by a named *caitya*.

祇洹精舍大院各有二門。一門東向一門北向。此園即須達長者布金錢買地處。精舍當中央。佛住此處最久。說法度人經行坐處。亦盡起塔。皆有名字。(860c14–17)

Rājagṛha (Wangshe 王舍)

5. In the slope of the Ḡḍhrakūṭa (Qishejue 耆闍崛) Mountain, there is a cave in front of which the Buddha, while *spacing mindfully*, was injured by Devadatta's (Diaoda 調達) rolling rock. This rock still stands.

佛在石室前東西經行。調達於山北嶮巖間橫擲石傷佛足指處。石猶在。(862c26–27)

6. Outside the Old City (Jiucheng 舊城), there is a large black stone on which a legendary suicidal *bhikṣu* used to *pace mindfully*.

離此五十步有大方黑石²⁴。昔有比丘在上經行。思惟是身無常苦空。得不淨觀厭患是身。即捉刀欲自殺復念世尊制戒不得自殺。又念雖爾我今但欲殺三毒賊。便以刀自刎。始傷肉得須陀洹。既半得阿那含。斷已成阿羅漢果般泥洹。(863a16–22)

Gayā (Jiaye 伽耶)

7. There is a site under the Pattra (*beiduo* 貝多) Tree where the Buddha *paced mindfully* in the second week of his Enlightenment.

²⁴ Following the *Taishō apparatus critici* (8) Sō 宋-Gen 元-Min 明 and Kū 宮, I suppressed the graph *ku* 窟 inserted after *shi* 石. See Nagasawa, *Hokken den yakuchū kaisetsu*, 85 and 313.

佛成道已七日觀樹受解脫樂處。佛於貝多樹下東西經行七日處。(b13–14)

8. In his previous birth, King Aśoka (Ayu 阿育) was a small boy who offered soil to the Buddha, and the latter brought it to his ground for *mindful pacing*.

阿育王昔作小兒時。當道戲過釋迦佛²⁵行乞食。小兒歡喜。即以一掬土施佛。佛持還泥經行地。因此果報作鐵輪王王閻浮提。(b23–26)

Kauśāmbī (Jushanmi 拘睢彌)

9. Away from Ghositārāma (Jushiluoyuan 瞿師羅園), there is a site where the Buddha *paced mindfully*, the location of which is commemorated by a *caitya*.

佛本於此度惡鬼處。亦常在此住經行坐處。皆起塔。亦有僧伽藍。可百餘僧。(864a24–25)

Campā (Zhanbo 瞻波)

10. There is a site, where the Buddha *paced mindfully*, the location of which is commemorated by a *caitya*.

瞻波大國佛精舍經行處及四佛坐處。悉起塔。現有僧住。(c5–6)

Above, I have made consistent use of ‘to pace mindfully’ instead of Faxian’s *jingxing*. Technically, however, the choice of ‘mindfully’ would harbor a risk of colliding unnecessarily with the disparate concept of *smṛti*, of which translation nowadays is firmly established

²⁵ In fact, the *Taishō* edition represents ‘Jiashe Fo’ 迦葉佛 (Kāśyapa Buddha), but I emended the reading for ‘Śākyamuni’, honoring the *Taishō apparatus critici* (23) Sō-Gen-Min and Kū 宮 as well as the better-known *locus classicus* of the story in the *Aśokāvadāna*. See Zhang, *Faxian zhuan jiaozhu*, 130, note 57. Also see Deeg, *Das Gaoseng-Faxian-Zhuan*, 462–63.

as ‘mindfulness’.²⁶ On the other hand, the translation ‘walk in meditation’, as found in many other exegeses, could carry unwanted emphasis on ‘meditation’ as a generally codified routine of Buddhist practice. I therefore intentionally choose the riskier distinction, which offers some distance from a more well-known custom of translation.

It will now prove useful to consider, albeit briefly, how the term was historically understood in several major translations of the text into the European languages. Unfortunately, the length constraints of this essay prohibit me from examining translations of all ten expressions listed above. However, I trust that what matters here is the identification of a pattern, and I will therefore limit my focus to the very first occurrence of the word in Faxian’s text, *Sāṅkāśya* (1).²⁷

To begin with, Jean-Pierre Abel-Rémusat (1788–1832) offers *parcourir*.²⁸ It is unknown whether the pioneering Orientalist sought a literal translation by approximating the underlying morphological structure of the original term—whether the Chinese or Indic—in his use of the Latin-derived French verb with its prefix *par*. Whether intentionally or not, this is, no doubt, a supremely graceful translation of *jingxing* (or even *caṅkrama*) into French. To one’s disappointment, however, the direct English re-translation of the French version yields the verb *journey*, which dismisses all multifold trans-linguistic subtlety of Abel-Rémusat’s *parcourir*.²⁹ Samuel Beal’s (1825–1889) *walk for exercise* is, likewise, not entirely satisfactory.³⁰ Even worse is the translation

²⁶ Cf. Gyatso ed., *In the Mirror of Memory*.

²⁷ Hereafter, when Faxian’s reference to *jingxingchu* is cited, I will, for the sake of convenience, use these serial numbers in parentheses, taken from the preceding paragraph that listed such venues in sequence, instead of repeating the *Taishō* citations again and again.

²⁸ Abel Rémusat, *Foë Kouë Ki*, 126.

²⁹ See *The Pilgrimage of Fa Hian*, 132. Strangely, this English version does not credit an individual as its translator, but it is widely known that the work was done by John Watson Laidlay (1808–1885), who also incorporated, into this re-translation, scholarship by Horace Hayman Wilson (1786–1860) and Christian Lassen (1800–1876), among others. See ‘Notes of the Quarter’, 170.

³⁰ Beal, *Travels*, 67.

by Herbert Allen Giles (1845–1935), who claims, in his first attempt at translating Faxian, to have produced an ‘improved rendering’ of Beal’s version, but in doing so ends up offering the phrase *take exercise*.³¹

The superior translation comes to us from James Legge (1815–1897), who simply translates *jingxing* as *to walk*, but who, in his annotation, requalifies the term as *to walk in meditation*, and even alludes to *caṅkramaṇa* or *jingxingchu* 經行處.³² This insightful addition can be credited to Legge’s co-resident in Hong Kong, namely Ernst Johann Eitel (1838–1908), who published his important dictionary just in time for Legge’s translation.³³ Although Legge does not mention the famous Caṅkramaṇa of Bodhgayā (7), the famed monument itself had been introduced well before Eitel, most prominently by Robert Spence Hardy (1803–1868), who understood this to mean a *caitya of ambulation*.³⁴ Following the watershed contribution by Legge, there remains no question how to render *jingxing*. Even Giles, in his re-translation, emends his earlier infelicity (*walk for exercise*) to *walk in meditation*.³⁵ In our time, too, Max Deeg, in his commanding study in German, renders the expression as in *Meditation wandeln*.³⁶ More recently, Jean-Pierre Drège offers *marcher*, which, again, may not be fully satisfactory.³⁷

³¹ Giles, *Record*, 36.

³² Legge, *A Record*, 51.

³³ Legge’s debt to Eitel’s work, especially the latter’s foremost clarification of Indic terminology, is candidly acknowledged in the former’s Preface (*A Record*, xi). Cf. Girardot, *The Victorian Translation*, 74–75. Eitel’s headword is indeed *caṅkramaṇa*, spelled quaintly as *tchangkramana* or *tchangkramasthāna*. *Hand-Book for the Student of Chinese Buddhism*, 144, (The latter, first edition of the dictionary, which Legge actually cited, is difficult to find nowadays. Thus I also cite the popular, revised and expanded second edition, *Hand-Book of Chinese Buddhism*, 173)

³⁴ Hardy, *A Manual of Buddhism* [sic], 181, which spells it ‘chaitya of chankramana.’

³⁵ Giles, *The Travels*, 26.

³⁶ Deeg, *Das Gaoseng*, 533.

³⁷ Drège, *Mémoire*, 29.

IV. Conclusion

Apart from these philological particulars, an interesting thing to note about Faxian's quote of either *jingxing* or *jingxingchu* is that the expression does not occur until he crosses the Indus (Xintou 新頭) to enter the bounds of 'India' (or Tianzhu 天竺). More precisely, the expression does not even appear when he enters Greater India at large, but only when he arrives in 'Middle India' (Madhyadeśa), or Zhongguo 中國. Indeed, only when crossing the Yamunā (Yaobuna 遙捕那) from Mathurā (Motouluo 摩頭羅) does Faxian at last verbalize the word for the first time.³⁸ Following Faxian's itineraries, the very first locality he would have encountered in Madhyadeśa is Sāṅkāśya (1), where he notices a *jingxingchu* commemorated with the connection to the so-called Four Buddhas of the Bhadra-kalpa (Xianjie 賢劫). Then, as Faxian leaves India from the port of Tāmralipti (Duomalidi 多摩梨帝) in the direction of Siṃhaladvīpa or Shiziguo 師子國 (present-day Sri Lanka), we never see him use the word again. For Faxian, the referent notion seems strictly reserved for the sacred worthies, especially the Historical Buddha, and his career in Madhyadeśa or the Gangetic Plains proper.

³⁸ For Yamunā, the *Taishō* edition (859a24) offers, indeed, without any critical apparatus, the corrupt reading of Puna 蒲那. This is the same textual corruption that confounded Legge (*A Record*, 42, note 3), who wrote, '[w]hy it is called, as here, the P'oo-na has yet to be explained'. But the challenging variant is preceded by *youjing* 又經, which is represented in several other editions as *youyao* 有遙 instead as Zhang Xun (*Faxian zhuan*, 55, note 2) collates. Also, *pu* is rendered in those latter editions as *bu* 捕 (without the 'grass' radical atop), a critical interpretation that I, too, assume to result in 'Yaobuna' instead.

Bibliography

Abbreviation

T *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō* 大正新脩大藏經. See Bibliography, Secondary Sources, Takakusu and Watanabe, eds.

Primary Sources

- Daoxing banruo jing* 道行般若經 [*Aṣṭasāhasrikā-prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*]. 10 *juan*. By Zhi Loujiachen (or °-chan) 支婁迦讖 or Lokakṣema. ca. late second century. *T* no. 224.
- Fanmoyu jing* 梵摩渝經 [*Brahmāyu-sūtra*]. 1 *juan*. Zhi Qian 支謙. Mid-third century. *T* no. 76.
- Gaoseng Faxian zhuan* 高僧法顯傳 [Life of the eminent monk Faxian]. 1 *juan*. By Faxian 法顯 (trad. 337–ca. 422). 416 CE. *T* no. 2085.
- Han shu* 漢書 [Book of Han]. 100 *juan*. By Ban Gu 班固 (32–92). In *Dianjiaoben Han shu* 點校本漢書 [Book of Han: Punctuated and collated]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju 中華書局, 1962.
- Hou Han shu* 後漢書 [Book of the Latter Han]. 120 *juan*. By Fan Ye 范曄 (398–446). *Dianjiaoben Hou Han shu* 點校本後漢書 [Book of the Latter Han: Punctuated and collated]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju 中華書局, 1965.
- Liudu ji jing* 六度集經 [*Ṣaṭpāramitā-saṃgraha*]. 8 *juan*. By Kang Senghui 康僧會. *T* no. 152.
- Puyao jing* 普曜經 [Lalitavistara]. 8 *juan*. Trans. Zhu Fahu 竺法護 or Dharmarakṣa in 308 CE. *T* no. 186.
- Wenshushili wen pusashu jing* 文殊師利問菩薩署經 [Mañjuśrī's Inquiry Concerning the Bodhisattva Career]. 1 *juan*. By Zhi Loujiachen (or °-chan) 支婁迦讖 or Lokakṣema. ca. late second century. *T* no. 458.
- Yizu jing* 義足經 [*Arthavargīya-sūtra*]. 2 *juan*. By Zhi Qian 支謙 in mid-third century. *T* no. 198.
- Zheng Fabua jing* 正法華經 [*Saddharmapundarīka-sūtra*]. 10 *juan*. By Zhu Fahu 竺法護 or Dharmarakṣa in 286 CE. *T* no. 263.

Secondary Sources

- Abel Rémusat, Jean-Pierre. *Foë Kouë Ki, ou Relation des royaumes bouddhiques: Voyage dans la Tartarie, dans l'Afghanistan et dans l'Inde, exécuté, à la fin du IVe siècle, par Chy'Fâ Hian* [Foguo ji or Accounts of Buddhist Kingdoms. Translated from Chinese and commented]. Paris: Imprimerie Royal, 1836.
- Adachi Kiroku 足立喜六. *Hokken den: Chūa Indo Nankai kikō no kenkyū* 法顯傳: 中亞, 印度, 南海紀行の研究 [Life of Faxian: Study on his travel to Central Asia, India, and southern seas]. Tōkyō: Hōzōkan 法藏館, 1940.
- Anonymous. 'Notes of the Quarter (October, November, December 1893.)'. *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland* 26, no. 1 (1894): 165–209.
- Beal, Samuel. *Travels of Fab-Hian and Sung-Yun, Buddhist Pilgrims, from China to India (400 A.D. and 518 A.D.)*. London: Trübner, 1869.
- Chen Xiulan 陳秀蘭. *Dunhuang suwenxue yuhui suyuan* 敦煌俗文學語彙溯源 [Origins of lexemes in the popular literature of Dunhuang]. Changsha: Yuelu Shushe 岳麓書社, 2001.
- Deeg, Max. *Das Gaoseng-Faxian-Zhuan als religionsgeschichtliche Quelle: der älteste Bericht eines chinesischen buddhistischen Pilgermönchs über seine Reise nach Indien mit Übersetzung des Textes* [The Gaoseng Faxian zhuan as a Source for the History of Religion: The Oldest Record of a Chinese Buddhist Pilgrim Monk on his Journey to India with Translation of the Text]. *Studies in Oriental Religions* 52. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 2005.
- Drège, Jean-Pierre. *Mémoire sur les pays bouddhiques* [A Record of Buddhist Countries]. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 2013.
- Eitel, Ernst Johann. *Hand-Book of Chinese Buddhism, Being a Sanskrit-Chinese Dictionary, with Vocabularies of Buddhist Terms in Pali, Singhalese, Siamese, Burmese, Tibetan, Mongolian and Japanese*. London: Trübner & Co., 1888.
- . *Hand-Book for the Student of Chinese Buddhism*. Hong Kong: Lane, Crawford & Co., 1870.
- Giles, Herbert Allen. *Record of the Buddhistic Kingdoms: Translated from the Chinese by Faxian*. London: Trübner & Co, 1877.

- . *The Travels of Fa-hsien (399–414 A.D.), or Record of the Buddhistic Kingdoms*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1923.
- Girardot, Norman J. *The Victorian Translation of China: James Legge's Oriental Pilgrimage*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.
- Gyatso, Janet ed. *In the Mirror of Memory: Reflections on Mindfulness and Remembrance in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism*. Albany: SUNY Press, 1992.
- Hardy, R. Spence. *A Manual of Buddhism in its Modern Development, Translated from Singhalese Mss.* London: Partridge and Oakey, 1853.
- Karashima, Seishi. *A Critical Edition of Lokakṣema's Translation of the Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā*. Tokyo: International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, 2011.
- . *A Glossary of Dharmarakṣa's Translation of the Lotus Sutra*. Tokyo: International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, 1998.
- . *A Glossary of Kumārajīva's Translation of the Lotus Sutra*. Tokyo: International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, 2001.
- . *A Glossary of Lokakṣema's Translation of the Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā*. Tokyo: International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, 2010.
- Kim Minku. 'Where the Blessed One Paced Mindfully: The Issue of Caṅkrama on Mathurā's Earliest Free-Standing Images of the Buddha'. *Archives of Asian Art* 69, no. 2 (2019): 181–216.
- Laidlay, John Watson. *The Pilgrimage of Fa Hian: From the French Edition of the 'Foe Koue Ki' of MM. Rémusat, Klaproth, and Landresse with Additional Notes and Illustrations*. Calcutta: Baptist Mission Press, 1848.
- Legge, James. *A Record of Buddhistic Kingdoms: Being An Account by the Chinese Monk Fa-Hien of His Travels in India and Ceylon (A.D. 399–414) in Search of the Buddhist Books of Discipline*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1886.
- Li Weiqi 李維琦. *Fojing ciyu huishi* 佛經詞語匯釋 [Comprehensive study of Buddhist scriptural lexicons]. Changsha: Hunan Shifan

- Daxue 湖南師範大學, 2004.
- Lim Sang-hee [Im Sanghŭi] 林祥姬. *Kosŭng pŏp'yŏnjŏn: Koryŏ chaejo taejanggyŏng ŭi kyogam mit yŏkchu* 高僧法顯傳: 高麗再雕大藏經의 校勘 및 譯註 [*Life of the eminent monk Faxian: The Second Korean Canon edition collated and annotated*]. Seoul: Ayŏn Ch'ulp'anbu 亞研出版部, 2013.
- Luo Zhufeng 羅竹風, ed. *Hanyu da cidian* 漢語大詞典 [The Great Lexical Dictionary of Chinese], 13 vols. Shanghai: Cishu 辭書, 1986–1993.
- Matsumura Akira 松村明, ed. *Daijirin* 大辭林 [Great forest of words]. Tōkyō: Sanseidō 三省堂, 1988.
- Monier-Williams, Monier. *A Sanskrit-English Dictionary: Etymologically and Philologically Arranged with Special Reference to Cognate Indo-European Languages*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1899.
- Nagasawa Kazutoshi 長沢和俊. *Hokken den yakuchū kaisetsu: Hokusō-bon, Nansō-bon, Kōrai Daizōkyō-bon, Ishiyamadera-bon yonshu ein to sono hikaku kenkyū* 法顯傳: 訳註・解説: 北宋本・南宋本・高麗大藏經本・石山寺本四種影印とその比較研究 [Annotated translation and commentaries of the *Life of Faxian*: Facsimiles of Northern Song, Southern Song, Korean Canon editions and the Ishiyamadera version and the comparison of these four versions]. Tōkyō: Yūzankaku 雄山閣, 1996.
- Nattier, Jan. *A Guide to the Earliest Chinese Buddhist Translations: Texts from the Eastern Han and Three Kingdoms Periods*. Tokyo: International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism, 2008.
- Pulleyblank, Edwin G. *Lexicon of Reconstructed Pronunciation in Early Middle Chinese, Late Middle Chinese and Early Mandarin*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1991.
- Sasagawa Kōsen 笹川浩仙. 'Kinhin ni tsuite: Tokuni ashi no hakobi ni tsuite' 経行について: 特に足の運びについて [About *caṅkrama*: Especially concerning motions of feet]. *Shūgaku kenkyū* 宗学研究 [Religious Studies] 29 (1987): 107–12.
- Schuessler, Axel. *ABC Etymological Dictionary of Old Chinese*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2007.

- . *Minimal Old Chinese and Later Han Chinese: A Companion to Grammata Serica Recensa*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009.
- Shinmura Izuru 新村出, ed. *Kōjien* 広辞苑 [*Wide garden of words*]. Tōkyō: Iwanami 岩波, 1955.
- Soothill, William Edward, and Lewis Hodous. *A Dictionary of Chinese Buddhist Terms: With Sanskrit and English Equivalents and a Sanskrit-Pali Index*. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co, 1937.
- Takakusu Junjirō 高楠順次郎, and Watanabe Kaigyoku 渡邊海旭, eds. *Taishō shinsbū daizōkyō* 大正新修大藏經 [Buddhist Canon Compiled under the Taishō Era (1912–1926)]. 100 vols. Tokyo: Taishō issaikyō kankōkai 大正一切經刊行會, 1924–1932.
- Vetter, Tilmann. *A Lexicographical Study of An Shigao's and His Circle's Chinese Translations of Buddhist Texts*. Tokyo: International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 2012.
- Yi Chaech'ang 李載昌. 'Kosŭng Pōp'yōn jōn' 高僧法顯傳 [*Life of the eminent monk Faxian*]. In *Kosŭngjōn oe* 高僧傳外 [*Life of eminent monks and other texts*], Han'gŭl taejanggyōng 한글大藏經 [The Hangul Tripitaka], vol. 248, 27–29; 493–546. Seoul: Tongguk Yōkkyōngwōn 東國譯經院, 1998.
- . *Pōp'yōn jōn* 法顯傳 [*Life of Faxian*]. Seoul: Tongguk Taehakkyo Pulchōn Kanhaeng Wiwōnhoe 東國大學校佛典刊行委員會, 1980.
- Zacchetti, Stefano. 'A "New" Early Chinese Buddhist Commentary: The Nature of the *Da anban shouyi jing* T 602 Reconsidered'. *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 31 (2008): 421–84.
- Zhang Xun 章巽. *Faxian zhuan jiaozhu* 法顯傳校注 [*Life of Faxian: Collated and annotated*]. Shanghai: Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe 上海古籍出版社, 1985.
- Zhu Qingzhi 朱慶之. *Fodian yu zhonggu Hanyu cibui yanjiu* 佛典與中古漢語詞彙研究 [Study on the Buddhist scriptural and Early and Middle Chinese lexemes]. Taipei: Wenjin 文津, 1992.